

NORTH YORKSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

SCRUTINY OF HEALTH COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting held at County Hall, Northallerton on 18 November 2011, commencing at 10.00 am.

PRESENT:-

County Councillor Jim Clark (Chairman).

County Councillors:-Val Arnold, Andrew Backhouse, John Blackie, John Clark, Polly English, Andrew Goss, Mike Knaggs, Margaret Hulme, Shelagh Marshall, John McCartney, Heather Moorhouse and Chris Pearson.

District Council Members: - Helen Firth (Craven), Shirley Shepherd (Hambleton), Ian Galloway (Harrogate), John Raper (Ryedale) Jim Preston (Scarborough) and Kay McSherry (Selby).

In attendance:- Executive Member County Councillor Clare Wood, County Councillors Tony Hall and Herbert Tindall and District Councillor Elizabeth Shields (Ryedale).

Officers: Helen Taylor & Seamus Breen (Health & Adult Services), Bryon Hunter (Scrutiny Team Leader), Jane Wilkinson (Legal and Democratic Services).

Present by Invitation:

NHS North Yorkshire & York – Amanda Brown, Angela Hall, Pat Sloss & Lorraine Naylor.
Stillington GP Surgery – Gail Martin (Practice Manager).

Apologies for absence were submitted on behalf of District Councillor Tony Pelton (Richmondshire).

In attendance two members of the public.

COPIES OF ALL DOCUMENTS CONSIDERED ARE IN THE MINUTE BOOK

The Committee noted that district Councillor Tony Pelton had suffered a serious stroke during the summer but hoped to resume his attendance at meetings of the Committee in the New Year. On behalf of the Committee the Chair agreed to send a letter wishing him a speedy recovery.

96. MINUTES

That the Minutes of the meeting held on 23 September 2011 to be taken as read and be confirmed and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

97. CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

Copies of the documents referred to below were tabled at the meeting and a copy placed in the Minute Book.

- Independent Review of Healthcare Services in North Yorkshire and York – Letter from Alan Wittrick, Director of Finance, Yorkshire and the Humber Strategic Health Authority.

- NHS 111 – Letter from Jayne Brown OBE, Chief Executive, NHS North Yorkshire and York.
- Accident and Emergency at Pontefract Hospital - Briefing paper.

In view of its importance the Committee requested regular progress reports on implementation of the findings of the Independent Review of Healthcare Services in North Yorkshire and York.

It was reported that the pilot of NHS 111 in North Yorkshire had now concluded. Members requested a report on the findings of the pilot be considered at the next meeting if and only if there were 'lessons to be learned'.

98. PUBLIC QUESTIONS OR STATEMENTS

There were no questions or statements from members of the public concerning issues not listed on the agenda.

RESOLVED –

That those Members of the public present at the meeting who wished to speak on items listed on the agenda would be invited to do so during consideration of that item.

99. HEALTH & ADULT SERVICES

The Chairman introduced and welcomed Helen Taylor, the County Council's recently appointed new Corporate Director for Health and Adult Services.

Helen Taylor gave a brief oral report in which she outlined the priorities for the Directorate. She stressed the importance of integration and said she looked forward to working with the Committee in the future.

The Corporate Director was asked to comment on whether she considered the Care Quality Commission to be fit for purpose.

Helen Taylor replied that the focus of the Care Quality Commission had shifted over the course of the past year. She said she was concerned that the focus of regulatory inspections was now about ensuring compliance with minimum standards as opposed to providing an underlying safeguard. This change she said had significant implications for commissioners.

NOTED

100. ESTABLISHING A NORTH YORKSHIRE HEALTH AND WELLBEING BOARD

CONSIDERED –

The report of the Corporate Director Health & Adult Services summarising proposals for the establishment of a shadow Health and Wellbeing Board (H&WB) for North Yorkshire.

The report was introduced by Seamus Breen who said that establishing a Board in North Yorkshire was proving to be particularly complex. He highlighted that not all of the Clinical Commissioning Groups were coterminous with county boundaries and said that most of the acute providers were located outside of North Yorkshire. North Yorkshire was unique in both its size and composition. Consultation results on the provisional recommendations for a Health & Well Being Transition Board were

reported. The Committee noted the general enthusiasm amongst stakeholders for a Board and the support for its size to be kept to a minimum and for it to have a strategic role. It was noted that there was widespread support for development of a wider health and well being network reporting to the Board, that would include an Adult Partnership similar to the Children's Trust.

Members were asked to comment on the proposed composition of the Board and whether a representative of the voluntary sector should be included. Members were also asked to consider the relationship between overview and scrutiny and the Board. Members noted that the Committee's comments would be referred to the Executive when it considered the proposals at its meeting on 29 November 2011.

County Councillor Shelagh Marshall enquired why her comments were not included in the table of consultation results appended to the report. Seamus Breen replied that all submissions had been anonymised but that he was satisfied that the views expressed had been captured. Councillor Marshall had expressed support for the voluntary sector and this was reflected in the report. In due course the consultation results would be published on the county council's web-site.

County Councillor Shelagh Marshall expressed support for a representative from a national organisation for older people to be on the Board. Seamus Breen highlighted that the Primary Care Trust will be represented on the Shadow Health & Well Being Board and from 1 April 2013 the NHS Commissioning Board will be represented. The development of Healthwatch in North Yorkshire would he said be critical as to whether a representative of for example Age UK was appointed.

The Committee noted that the venue for meetings of the Board had yet to be determined but that every effort would be taken to ensure they were accessible. It was proposed that as from April 2012 all meetings of the Shadow Board if not held in public should be open to invitees such as county councillors to attend.

It was acknowledged that the weakest response in respect of the Board was from young people. Consequently further work was planned so as to present the data in a format that made it more accessible to young people. A series of meetings with young people was scheduled over the course of the next two weeks and the results were to be reported to the Executive.

Concern was expressed about the ability of a single district councillor representative being able to adequately represent the views of all constituent authorities. The Committee was advised that good communications will be essential and the development of a vibrant or network feeding into the Board was seen as the way forward. Seamus Breen advised the Committee that the Leaders of district councils in North Yorkshire had been approached and asked to nominate a representative. The Leader of Richmondshire District Council, County Councillor John Blackie had been elected. The County Council's Monitoring Officer had however to determine whether County Councillor Blackie had a conflict of interest and was able to carry out this new role as he was currently the Vice Chair of the County Council's Scrutiny of Health Committee. A Member commented that by asking for invitations from only the Leaders of district councils this limited the available choice and that it would have been better to extend the invitation to other elected members who had the necessary experience. County Councillor Polly English expressed disappointment that Craven did not have representation on the County Council's Executive or the Health & Well Being Board. It was suggested that as both the Craven clinical commissioning group and the commissioning support unit were not coterminous with County Council boundaries there was a danger that Craven could become the poor 'relation' of healthcare in North Yorkshire.

County Councillor John Blackie said he would do his best and referred to his previous experience. He gave assurances that he would devise a way to properly communicate with all of the district councils. It was his intention to report not only the outcome of Board meetings but also to alert district councils to any emerging issues. He expressed strong support for the appointment of separate healthwatch and voluntary sector representatives.

The Chairman expressed the view that acute providers should not have representation on the Board as they did not commission services. This view was supported by the Committee.

In summing up Members of the Committee were very supportive of the establishment of a Shadow Health & Well Being Board for North Yorkshire. The Committee agreed that the Board should have a strategic role and that it was more likely to be successful if its overall size was restricted. Members therefore supported the development of a wider health and well-being network operating underneath the Board as referred to in the report. Representation on the Board by the Voluntary Sector was also agreed as was the number of district council representatives being increased to two. Members agreed that meetings of the Board should be held in public as from April 2012.

RESOLVED –

That the comments made during the meeting and included in the Minutes be referred to the Executive for consideration at its meeting on 29 November 2011.

101. SUBSTANCE MISUSE TENDER IN SCARBOROUGH, WHITBY & RYEDALE

County Councillor Tony Hall declared a personal interest in the following item as the County Council's representative on The Council of Governors of the Tees Esk & Wear Valleys Mental Health Foundation Trust. He stated that the Trust had submitted a bid for providing drug and alcohol misuse services in Scarborough, Whitby and Ryedale and because of this he had not responded to being lobbied by the current providers.

CONSIDERED –

The joint report of the Scrutiny Team Leader and NHS North Yorkshire and York on the procurement of drug and alcohol misuse treatment services in Scarborough, Whitby and Ryedale.

Members were advised of the reasons the services were being put out to tender. The main drivers being the current multi-agency approach meant that there was no straightforward pathway for users to access the services. Also there were concerns surrounding the quality of performance data and in particular it was not clear if service targets/outcomes were being delivered. The Committee noted that a series of meetings held with existing providers had failed to find a solution to these problems.

Angela Hall, Commissioning Manager, NHS North Yorkshire & York outlined the procurement timetable for the tender of the services. The deadline for receipt of bids was 1 December 2011.

In his capacity as Chair of the Care & Independence Overview & Scrutiny Committee, County Councillor Tony Hall welcomed the report. He said that the services provided by the Drug & Alcohol Team had been the subject of a very scathing report and he was supportive of a new approach to substance misuse in North Yorkshire. He stressed that the biggest problem in North Yorkshire was

alcohol misuse not drugs. County Councillor Tony Hall requested that the report be circulated with a covering letter to all Members of the Care & Independence Overview & Scrutiny Committee for information. He suggested that alcohol misuse and domestic violence should be priority areas of work for the Health & Well Being Board. It was noted that currently there is no data available on the links between alcohol abuse and domestic violence and that this needed to be addressed.

The Committee asked to be kept informed of progress of the procurement of services and said that it would be particularly helpful if the information could be provided from a district perspective.

County Councillor John Blackie commented that if it was not known what services were needed the recommendations in the Independent Review of Healthcare Services in North Yorkshire & York conducted by Professor Hugo Mascie Taylor regarding the removal of in-patient beds were of concern and he stressed the importance of the success of the current procurement exercise.

Members acknowledged the progress made and looked forward to receiving further progress reports in due course.

RESOLVED –

That further progress reports on the procurement of alcohol and substance misuse services in Scarborough, Whitby and Ryedale be referred to the Scrutiny of Health Committee, Care & Independence Overview & Scrutiny Committee and relevant district council in North Yorkshire in due course.

102. DEVELOPMENT OF A STRATEGY FOR HEALTHCARE SERVICES IN WHITBY

CONSIDERED –

The report of Amanda Brown, Locality Director, Hambleton, Richmond and Whitby, NHS North Yorkshire & York on the development of a strategy for healthcare provision in Whitby.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Sarah Wyatt on behalf of Whitby Hospital Action Group addressed the meeting. She expressed concern that the development of a strategy for healthcare provision in Whitby would be based on an affordable business case as opposed to the healthcare needs of the local population. The people of Whitby were she said very unhappy at the prospect of losing even more healthcare services. The operating theatres were the cornerstone of the Whitby Hospital. She complained about a lack of public consultation and about decisions being made behind closed doors. The public wanted a forum in which they could ask questions about Whitby Hospital and get proper replies and be consulted on any proposed changes. People found it difficult to travel to Scarborough or Middlesbrough to receive treatment. The Council had had recently granted planning permission for the building of 147 houses in the area and this would increase the pressure on Whitby Hospital even further. She concluded by saying that people in Whitby had a right to receive healthcare and were fed of being told there was no money.

Amanda Brown addressed the meeting. She highlighted events that had taken place during the year which had prompted the need to develop a strategy. She stressed the importance of developing a model for Whitby Hospital that would be sustainable. She acknowledged that services had in the past been fragile but was optimistic about the future. The clinical commissioning group for Hambleton, Richmondshire and Whitby were very keen to make progress and already stronger commissioning arrangements between the Primary Care Trust and the County Council were in place. It was not yet clear how the recommendations in the Independent Review of

Healthcare Services in North Yorkshire & York would be implemented as the Project Director Alan Wittrick had only just been appointed. Implementation of the review recommendations were intrinsically linked to the development of a strategy for healthcare provision in Whitby. The Committee noted that a business case for Whitby Hospital was due to be considered by the PCT's Transition and Reform Board on 5 January 2012. The outcome of that meeting would be reported to the Committee at its meeting on 27 January 2012.

Members commented that the report did little to allay public fears about the future of the hospital. Also that the tight timescale proposed left very little room for public engagement. Members requested that future reports also include specific reference to the healthcare services to be provided at Malton Hospital.

RESOLVED –

That the Health Scrutiny Committee:

- Notes the background describing key events requiring the development of a strategy for healthcare services in Whitby that fully takes into account the recommendations in the review conducted by Professor Hugo Mascie-Taylor.
- Notes the significant events this year that support the development of a strategy.
- Notes the Clinical Commissioning Group's intention to engage with patients and the public more effectively.
- Notes the plan to complete development of the business case for day case surgery by January 2012.
- Receives an update report on the development of a strategy for healthcare provision in Whitby and business case at its meeting in January 2012.
- That details of public and patient engagement involvement process be sent to the Scrutiny Team Leader and brought to the attention of the Chairman and local members.

103. APPLICATION FOR STILLINGTON SURGERY (YORK) TO CEASE USING SHERRIF HUTTON VILLAGE HALL FOR PATIENT CONSULTATIONS

CONSIDERED –

The report of the Primary Care Trust informing the Committee of the application by Stillington Surgery to cease using Sheriff Hutton Village Hall for patient consultations. Full details of the Stakeholder Engagement & Communication Plan were contained in the report. A summary of the results of the consultation undertaken with stakeholders was appended to the report. Members were invited to comment on the proposal.

The report was introduced by Lorraine Naylor, Assistant Director Primary Care, NHS North Yorkshire & York and Gail Martin, Practice Manager who said that what was proposed would not result in a reduction of service.

In her capacity as the local member, County Councillor Clare Wood said she was very disappointed by what was proposed. A lot of Sheriff Hutton residents were

elderly and disabled and not able to drive. They greatly appreciated the convenience of being able to see a doctor in their local village hall. Whilst she accepted it was a traditional service it was nevertheless still used by local residents and she would be sad to see it go. County Councillor Clare Wood stressed to the Committee however that the engagement process undertaken had been exemplary. County Councillor Clare Wood sought reassurances that the driver service set up for patients was sustainable, easy to access and being used as well as inexpensive.

Gail Martin responded saying that the driver service was up and running. Initially it had been funded by a grant from Comic Relief and had two drivers. Currently there were eleven drivers. The service covered a large catchment area and was proving to be increasingly popular. It conveyed patients to all healthcare appointments including hospitals and was not restricted to those at the surgery in Stillington. Patients accessed the service via the telephone and an answerphone was in operation. Patients were asked to give as much notice as possible. The service was free to patients and was funded through donations. The Surgery itself had held fund raising events and donated £500. Assurances were given that it was intended to be a long-term service.

The Committee noted that the number of patients seen at Sheriff Hutton Village Hall was in decline. Because the practice did not have exclusive use of the facilities at the Village Hall it was unable to provide IT/telemedicine services. Patient consultations could be overheard by other patients waiting in the corridor. The door to the village hall contained a glass panel and consultations were not confidential. To compensate for the withdrawal of consultations at Sheriff Hutton Village Hall as from January 2012 the Practice intended to extend its clinics at Stillington and offer patients an additional four appointment slots. This was possible because of the time saved by GPs through not having to travel to Sheriff Hutton.

After having read the report and listening to the evidence given by Practice Manager the Committee expressed support for the application.

RESOLVED –

That the Scrutiny of Health Committee supports the application by Stillington Surgery (York) to cease using Sherrif Hutton Village Hall for patient consultations.

104. DRAFT RESPONSES TO CONSULTATIONS BY BRADFORD DISTRICT NHS CARE TRUST AND THE YORKSHIRE AMBULANCE SERVICE ON APPLICATIONS FOR FOUNDATION STATUS

County Councillor Polly English declared a personal interest in the following item as a hospital manager with responsibility for conducting mental health hearings at Bradford District Care Trust.

CONSIDERED –

The report of the Scrutiny Team Leader inviting the Committee to agree its responses to consultations by Bradford District Care Trust (BDCT) and the Yorkshire Ambulance Service (YAS) on their proposals for operating as NHS Foundation Trusts. A copy of each response was appended to the report.

The report was introduced by Bryon Hunter, Scrutiny Team Leader, who said that the main issue on both consultations was the degree of elected member representation.

Members expressed unanimous support for the each of the draft responses appended to the report.

RESOLVED –

That the draft responses appended to the report are approved and the Chairman be authorised to respond on behalf of the Committee within the required deadlines.

105. WORK PROGRAMME

CONSIDERED –

The report of Bryon Hunter, Scrutiny Team Leader inviting Members to comment on and approve the content of the Committee's future work programme.

Members noted that the venue for the January meeting would be the recently opened new Selby District Council Civic Centre. This would give Members an opportunity to visit the new Selby District Hospital which operated from the same site. The main items on the agenda would be Accident & Emergency at Pontefract Hospital, Independent Review of Healthcare Services in North Yorkshire and York (as agreed earlier in the meeting) and NHS North Yorkshire & York's Policy on Individual Funding Requests (see work programme report).

County Councillor John McCartney said that the issues with Pontefract Hospital were not confined to the temporary closure of accident and emergency services. The Hospital had a new five year plan which contained various service reconfiguration proposals. He requested that the Committee be given an opportunity to review the content of this new 5 Year Plan as well as accident and emergency services at its January meeting. Members agreed to his suggestion.

The Scrutiny Team Leader drew Members attention to the paragraph in the report on Access to Health Care In Ryedale and sought support for the establishment of a Task Group.

RESOLVED –

That the content of the Committee's work programme be noted and approved.

That implementation of the Independent Review of Healthcare Services in North Yorkshire and York be a regular item on all future agenda of the Committee.

That a task group comprising of County Councillors John Blackie, John Clark, Val Arnold and District Councillor John Raper be established to take forward preliminary work on access to health care in Ryedale.

That the venue for the January 2012 meeting of the Committee be the new Selby District Council Civic Centre, Selby.

That a report on Accident and Emergency Services and the 5 Year Plan for Pontefract Hospital be referred to the next meeting.

The meeting concluded at 12.35 pm.

JW/ALJ